Diagnosis Of Pulmonary Tuberculosis: Utility Of Serology And Mantoux Reaction In A Resource-Limited Setting.

AUTHORS

M Garbati, H Yusuph, M Kagu, A Moses

Citation


Abstract

BACKGROUND: The use of tuberculin skin testing in the diagnosis of tuberculosis in endemic countries is further complicated by human immunodeficiency virus infection therefore; other methods may be desirable to clarify uncertainties.

AIM: To compare Tuberculin skin testing and serology in the diagnosis of tuberculosis.

METHODOLOGY: We studied 100 cases and 100 controls. Ziehl-Nelson sputum smear staining, Mantoux technique (Tuberculin Skin Test) and ELISA were used to diagnose tuberculosis. RESULTS: Fifty three percent of the cases had HIV co-infection. The Mantoux Test had a sensitivity of 45.28% in HIV/PTB patients and 21.28% in patients with PTB only. The serological test by ELISA was positive in 28/29 (96.6%) patients who had positive Mantoux test and in 21/24 (87.5%) patients with negative Mantoux. The overall sensitivity of the serologic test was found to be 94% (63/67) with specificity of 74%, while the positive and negative predictive values were 78% and 89%, respectively with efficiency of 82.5%.

CONCLUSION: Tuberculin skin test had a lower sensitivity than the serological technique in detecting cases of tuberculosis.

INTRODUCTION

The fact that Mycobacterium tuberculosis (MTB) produces a complex spectrum of immune responses is well known. The tuberculin skin test is one of the methods used for identifying infection with M. tuberculosis. New technology offers the opportunity for rapid alternative techniques for the diagnosis of tuberculosis and other mycobacterial diseases. Some of them may prove to be accurate, species-specific and easily applied.

Infection with MTB is invariably accompanied by hypersensitivity to tuberculin, which represents one of the first indications of contact with this organism. The response in tuberculin skin testing depends on this. Upon exposure to tubercle bacilli, lymphokines are secreted from specially sensitized T-lymphocytes. Humoral immune response is characterized by the production of antibodies directed against the invading agent, which forms the basis for serological tests. Studies have documented increase in total immunoglobulin levels and specific antimycobacterial antibodies in patients with TB. Hyper-gammaglobulinaemia and raised gamma-2 globulin with a corresponding decrease in albumin have also been reported in TB cases.

Diagnosis of tuberculosis currently depends on the demonstration of M. tuberculosis in clinical specimens. Two new approaches that may be applicable to the recognition of mycobacteria have emerged: immunoassay of mycobacterial antigens and nucleic acid probes. Immunoassay is cheap, uses stable reagents, does not require sophisticated equipment and can be performed in developing countries. The utility of this has however, not been determined in our setting where Mantoux testing still remains one of the main utilized tests.

The relationship between the degree of delayed hypersensitivity reaction and the levels of antibodies to MTB, and the clinical features are far from clear. Although currently the tuber-culin skin test antigens that are available are less than 100% sensitive and specific for detection of infection with M. tuberculosis, no better diagnostic method is widely available.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The study was a cross-sectional, comparative study...
comprising 100 consecutive consenting adults aged 15 years
and above with newly diagnosed PTB at the Medical
Outpatient Department (MOPD) of the University of
Maiduguri Teaching Hospital, Nigeria. The control group
consisted of age- and sex-matched 100 apparently healthy,
HIV-negative and PTB negative adults drawn from among
hospital staff and medical students. In addition to HIV
testing, all study subjects had both tuberculin skin testing
(TST) employing the Mantoux (Cadila Healthcare Limited,
Ahmedabad - 382445, Gujarat India) technique\(^{14}\) and
Enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay (ELISA) (Omega
Diagnostics Limited Scotland [UK]), following the
manufacturer’s guidelines.

Diagnosis of Pulmonary tuberculosis (PTB) was based on
the detection of Acid- and Alcohol-Fast Bacilli (AAFB) in
the sputa of patients. Study subjects were clinically
evaluated and blood was drawn for complete blood count
(CBC), erythrocyte sedimentation rate (ESR), and serologic
test for TB using ELISA. The Mantoux test reagent (PPD
RT Tween 80) was injected in the volar aspect of the left
arm and the reaction read after 72 hrs using a plastic rule
employing the “ball point technique” of Sokal.\(^{15}\) Excluded in
this study were those with suspicion of extrapulmonary TB
because of the challenges with diagnosis. Patients with other
causes of immunosuppression e.g. chronic renal failure,
diabetes mellitus, malignancies, prolonged steroid therapy
were also excluded.

Generated data was analyzed using SPSS Version 11 (SPSS,
Chicago, Ill, USA). Chi-square was used for categorical data
in comparing the results and student t-test was used to
compare means. Level of significance was pegged at p-value
≤0.05. Sensitivities, specificities, positive and negative
predictive values were calculated using the method of Galen
and Gambino.\(^{16}\)

RESULTS

The age range was 15-56 years for cases and 14-60 years for
the controls with a mean of 33.39 ±10.0 and 33.77 ± 10.56,
respectively (p<0.05). Fifty three percent of the PTB patients
were also HIV-infected. Tables 1 and 2 show the results of
TST for patients with HIV-associated, and Pulmonary TB
only, respectively. The TST was found to be positive in 55%
and 79% of HIV/PTB and PTB only groups, respectively. A
false positive TST was present in 12% of the control group.
The specificity was 12% in both HIV/PTB and PTB only
groups. The positive- and negative-predictive values were
21.4% and 10.2% in HIV/PTB and 71% and 88% in PTB
only groups, respectively.

Figure 1

Table 1. Mantoux reaction in patients with HIV-associated
PTB

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reaction (mm)</th>
<th>Cases (n=100)</th>
<th>Controls (n=100)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-4</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>≥5</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sensitivity: 24/53x100 = 45.28%
Specificity: 12/100x100 = 12%
Positive predictive value: 24/112x100 = 21.43%
Negative predictive value: 12/41x100 = 29.3%

Figure 2

Table 2. Mantoux reaction in patients with PTB only

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reaction (mm)</th>
<th>Cases (n=100)</th>
<th>Controls (n=100)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>≥10</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sensitivity: 10/47x100 = 21.28%
Specificity: 12/100x100 = 12.0%
Positive predictive value: 10/59x100 = 16.94%
Negative predictive value: 12/89x100 = 13.48%

Table 3 shows that among the cases, 91% had a positive TB
serologic test compared with 26% in the control group, with
a specificity of 74%. The positive- and negative-predictive
values were 78% and 89% with efficiency of 82.5%,
respectively.
Diagnosis Of Pulmonary Tuberculosis: Utility Of Serology And Mantoux Reaction In A Resource-Limited Setting. AUTHORS

**Figure 3**
Table 3. Values of measures of validity for the serologic test in study subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Serologic test</th>
<th>Subjects</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>Controls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Specificity: 91/100x100 = 91%
Sensitivity: 74/100x100 = 74%
Positive Predictive value: 91/117 x 100 = 77.8%
Negative Predictive Value: 74/83x100 = 89%
Efficiency: (91/74+91/26+9+74) x 100 = 82.5%

Tables 4 and 5 show the relationship between serology and Mantoux test in both HIV/PTB and TB only patients. The serological technique was positive in 28/29 (96.6%) patients who had positive Mantoux test and 21/24 (87.5%) patients with negative Mantoux.

**Figure 4**
Table 4. Relationship between serologic test and Mantoux reaction in patients with HIV/PTB

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Serologic test for TB</th>
<th>Mantoux reaction (mm)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>≥5</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Legend: Positive = induration size ≥5mm (HIV/PTB)
  Negative = induration size <5mm (HIV/PTB)

**Figure 5**
Table 5. Relationship between serologic test and Mantoux reaction in patients with PTB only

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Serologic test for TB</th>
<th>Mantoux reaction (mm)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>≥10</td>
<td>&lt;10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Legend: Positive = induration size ≥10mm (PTB only)
  Negative = induration size <10mm (PTB only)

**DISCUSSION**
This study has shown that the prevalence of HIV among TB patients is high (53%). Those in the 25-29-year age group were found to be most affected by TB and more than 80% of the population studied was below the age of 50 years. This agrees with earlier reports from other developing countries. The Mantoux reaction of 12% among the control group in this study could be attributed to previous exposure to mycobacteria.

Using the CDC criteria for the interpretation of TST, 55% of the HIV/PTB group had a positive reaction compared with 79% in the PTB only group. The negative predictive value of about 71% of Mantoux reaction in HIV/PTB makes it an inadequate screening test in this group compared with 88% in those with PTB only. The high negative Mantoux reaction in the study population might be due to anergy from HIV infection or malnutrition as a little over 50% of the patients studied had HIV-co-infection. Previous researchers had also reported anergy in their populations.

The sensitivity (91%) and specificity (74%) of the serologic test accord well with previous studies with the native 38kDa antigen. The high negative predictive value of this test (82.5%) makes it a potentially useful screening test to rule out active TB especially in HIV/PTB, where other diagnostic methods have failed. The sensitivity, specificity, and predictive values of the serologic test in this study were higher than those of Mantoux test in TB detection which is in keeping with the observation that in patients without significant sputum production and cutaneous anergy, the serologic test stands out as the “gold standard” superseded only by PCR in excluding tuberculosis.

The resurgence of TB in the era of HIV pandemic makes early diagnosis for chemotherapy or prophylaxis imperative since 50% of those infected with HIV will develop TB.

**CONCLUSION**
Both Mantoux and ELISA methods have been found to be useful in the diagnosis of TB, though the high level of anergy to the former, especially in the HIV-infected individuals has rendered this hitherto important test less effective. The serologic approach using ELISA in this regard is handy and therefore recommended for resolving this diagnostic dilemma.

**References**
2. Davies PDO. The pathogenesis of tuberculosis. Post Grad
Diagnosis Of Pulmonary Tuberculosis: Utility Of Serology And Mantoux Reaction In A Resource-Limited Setting. AUTHORS

Doctor Africa 1984; 6(9):269.
Author Information

MA. Garbati, FMCP
Senior Lecturer/Consultant Physician, Departments of Medicine, University of Maiduguri Teaching Hospital

H. Yusuph, FMCP
Senior Lecturer/Consultant Physician, Departments of Medicine, University of Maiduguri Teaching Hospital

MB. Kagu, FMCPath
Senior Lecturer/Consultant Haematologist, Haematology, University of Maiduguri Teaching Hospital

AE. Moses, PhD
Department of Microbiology, University of Maiduguri Teaching Hospital